

Name _____

Date _____

AP United States History**HARKNESS SEMINAR: Zinn v. Schweikart and Allen: *Two Views on Columbus***

Seminar Purpose: The Harkness Seminar is a highly structured student-led discussion of commonly read material that presents conflicting views of an important issue in American history. The purpose of the seminar is twofold: first, to get students engaged with the material; second, to get students to reflect on history and make critical judgments about the past.

Questions	CLAIM/S	EVIDENCE from the text	Notes on the most interesting points made during the discussion
What responsibility do historians have for accurately representing the truth? Can the truth be relative or is it absolute—or is it somewhere in between?			
What perspective does Zinn take with regard to Columbus? What evidence does he use to support his position on Columbus? Is the actual number of natives who died as important to Zinn as the fact that some died because of Columbus? Do you find his arguments convincing?			

<p><i>What perspective do Schweikart & Allen take with regard to Columbus? How do they use evidence to support their position? Do you find their arguments convincing? Which of their arguments do you believe has the most credibility?</i></p>			
<p><i>What would Zinn and Schweikart & Allen say about each other's approach to the study of Columbus and history in general?</i></p>			

<p><i>What do we owe to the people of the past? Is it fair to judge them by our present standards? Is Columbus a hero and should we celebrate Columbus Day?</i></p>			
---	--	--	--

Reflection:

What was the most intriguing **claim** you heard today and why?

Seminar Rules:

- 1. Students are encouraged not to express opinions without first referencing the text.**
- 2. Participation does not mean just repeating what someone else said!**
- 3. Participants will take turns (you MAY NOT talk until it is your turn).**
- 4. Participants will value the opinions of other participants.**
- 5. Participants will treat one another with respect.**